

(This report utilizes Samya in Hindu News by <u>American Hindus Against Defamation (AHAD)</u>, technology provided by <u>tattwa.ai</u>)

This is AHAD's response to the Southern Poverty Law Center Series: Hindu Supremacy in the United States interview with Sunita Vishwanath and Ram Vishwanathan.

Published Jan 5, 2025

The Misunderstood Narrative of Hindutva: Addressing Critiques

Introduction

Hindutva, often misinterpreted, embodies a type of cultural nationalism designed to unite India's diverse traditions under a shared ethos. Despite its goal of promoting inclusivity, it faces criticism, as illustrated in a recent Southern Poverty Law Center (SPLC) discussion featuring Sunita Vishwanath and Ram Vishwanathan, who label it a supremacist and fascist ideology. They mischaracterize Hindutva by linking it to exclusionary politics and global right-wing movements. These critiques depend on selective interpretations that overlook its nuanced cultural and historical context. This analysis examines significant criticisms of Hindutva from various viewpoints—including those of Hindus and Hinduism—and investigates issues such as historical slavery, communal violence, diaspora narratives, and contemporary political representation. **Pluralism in Hindutva**

Far from homogenizing Hindu identity, Hindutva cherishes India's diversity, celebrating traditions across languages, regions, and philosophies. Its vision counters narratives that pit communities against one another.

Revisiting Modi's "1,000 Years of Slavery" Comment

Prime Minister Narendra Modi's reference to "1,000 years of slavery" has often been criticized as nationalistic exaggeration. However, this comment encapsulates centuries of foreign invasions and colonial exploitation that disrupted India's cultural, spiritual, and economic systems. From the destruction of temples during Islamic invasions to the plundering of resources under British colonial rule, India's history reflects sustained efforts to erode its civilizational identity.

Drawing parallels with the African-American experience of slavery, this shared history of subjugation emphasizes resilience and the ongoing struggle for dignity. While Black slavery is universally recognized, the atrocities faced by Hindus during Islamic and colonial rule remain underrepresented in global narratives. Acknowledging this parallel promotes a shared

understanding of oppression, countering efforts to dismiss or minimize experiences of historical significance in Hindu history.

Babri Masjid, Mumbai Bomb Blasts, and Godhra: Contextualizing Violence

The demolition of the Babri Masjid in 1992 is often portrayed as indicative of Hindutva's alleged supremacist agenda. However, this oversimplification neglects a multifaceted movement grounded in the reclamation of Ram Janmabhoomi—a site of profound cultural and spiritual importance for Hindus. A non-Hindu audience might connect with this event by envisioning a statue of slave owners in Africa that symbolizes the legacy of capturing slaves. In reality, Islamic invaders captured and sold slaves following their victories in the Indian Subcontinent.

The post-demolition Mumbai bomb blasts of 1993 and the Godhra train burning in 2002 further highlight the interconnectedness of these events. The Mumbai blasts, orchestrated by underworld figures connected to extremist groups, targeted innocent civilians, while the Godhra tragedy entailed the burning of Hindu pilgrims. Understanding these incidents requires acknowledging the broader socio-political dynamics rather than framing Hindutva as the perpetrator of communal discord.

Debunking the "Hindu Supremacy" and MAGA Link

Critics often compare Hindutva to movements like MAGA, accusing it of fostering exclusion and majoritarianism. Hindutva's core philosophy emphasizes cultural pride and unity, rooted in India's millennia-old civilizational identity. Hindutva organizations in the diaspora focus on cultural preservation and community advocacy. Equating Hindutva with the supposed negative aspects of MAGA not only misrepresents its intent but also undermines the diaspora's contributions to fostering multiculturalism and solidarity. There is no evidence of Hindutva organizations aligning with white supremacist ideologies.

Recognizing Hinduphobia as a Form of Discrimination

The refusal to accept Hinduphobia as a legitimate form of discrimination comparable to antisemitism or Islamophobia reflects a broader dismissal of Hindu concerns. Hinduphobia manifests through temple desecrations, hate crimes, and pervasive stereotypes in academia and media. Ignoring these issues denies Hindus the right to articulate their grievances and seek redress.

Acknowledging Hinduphobia does not detract from other forms of discrimination; instead, it adds to the global discourse on equity and justice. By addressing Hinduphobia alongside other prejudices, we create a more inclusive narrative that recognizes the diverse challenges faced by marginalized communities.

Vivek Ramaswamy, Nikki Haley, and Usha Vance: Diaspora Success Stories

The success of individuals like Vivek Ramaswamy, Nikki Haley, and Usha Vance exemplifies the achievements of the Hindu diaspora in the United States. Their prominence challenges monolithic portrayals of Hindus as politically or ideologically uniform, showcasing the community's diversity.

Critics often link such successes to Hindutva's alleged alignment with right-wing ideologies. However, these individuals represent varied political and personal philosophies, reflecting the Hindu ethos of adaptability and integration. Their achievements underscore the diaspora's contributions to multicultural societies, fostering dialogue and understanding across diverse communities.

Countering the Misrepresentation of Hindutva

- 1. **Framing Hindutva as Supremacist:** Hindutva is often criticized as a racial ideology, but its foundations lie in cultural nationalism. It emphasizes unity amidst diversity, fostering a shared sense of belonging to India's civilizational ethos. This philosophy opposes colonial erasure and advocates cultural preservation rather than exclusion.
- 2. **Misrepresentation of Hindu Deities:** Critics argue that Hindutva reshapes Hindu gods into hypermasculine symbols of fear and violence. Hindu traditions celebrate diverse representations of divinity, encompassing feminine, masculine, androgynous forms. Lord Ram, for example, symbolizes dharma and justice rather than aggression.
- 3. **Association with Fascism:** Hindutva's alleged parallels with European fascism ignore its roots in anti-colonial resistance. While figures like Savarkar admired European organizational models, their vision centered on uniting a fragmented society rather than promoting authoritarianism.
- 4. **Homogenization of Hindu Identity:** Hindutva is accused of erasing India's syncretic traditions. However, it seeks to protect these traditions by countering external and colonial efforts to fragment India's cultural unity.
- 5. **Diaspora Advocacy:** Diaspora organizations inspired by Hindutva often work to preserve cultural identity and address community challenges. Their efforts are misrepresented as supremacist, undermining their role in fostering global dialogue and collaboration.

The Role of Historical Reformers and Pluralistic Traditions

Critiques of Hindutva often ignore India's rich tradition of reformers who challenged social hierarchies and caste discrimination. Figures like Narayana Guru, Basavanna, and Swami Vivekananda exemplify Hinduism's capacity for self-renewal and inclusivity. Hindutva aligns with this legacy by advocating social cohesion and equality while addressing historical injustices.

Conclusion: Towards a Nuanced Understanding

Hindutva is a philosophy rooted in cultural pride, resilience, and unity, yet it is frequently misrepresented in global discourse. We can foster a balanced understanding of its goals and contributions by addressing criticisms with evidence and context.

Recognizing Hinduphobia as a legitimate concern, celebrating diaspora successes, and contextualizing communal violence are essential steps toward building an inclusive narrative. Hindutva's emphasis on preserving India's civilizational identity aligns with universal values of justice and equity, offering lessons in resilience and pluralism for a global audience.

Like many nations, India's journey is marked by complexities, challenges, and triumphs. As one thread in this tapestry, Hindutva deserves to be understood in its entirety—rooted in cultural pride,

historical resilience, and a vision for unity amidst diversity. By fostering balanced discourse, we can move towards a future that respects all identities while celebrating the uniqueness of each.

References and Citations:

- 1. Vinayak Damodar Savarkar's "Hindutva: Who is a Hindu?" (1923) Contextualizing Hindutva's origins.
- 2. Sita Ram Goel's "Hindu Temples: What Happened to Them" (1990) Documenting the destruction of temples under Islamic invasions.
- 3. Ambedkar, B. R. (1946). "Who Were the Shudras?" Addressing caste and Hindu reform.
- 4. Ramesh, M. S. (2015). "India's Cultural Heritage." Exploring India's pluralistic ethos.
- 5. Data from Pew Research Center (2012): Documenting Hindu demographics in the diaspora.
- 6. **Post-1992 Violence Reports:** Government of India archives and Justice Liberhan Commission reports.